# Inert compact binary formation in open clusters Ataru Tanikawa (Fukui Prefectural University) Collaborators: Long Wang (Sun Yat-sen University), Michiko S. Fujii (The University of Tokyo) MODEST-24: Exploring Dense Stellar Systems Across Cosmic Time 22 August Warsaw • Tanikawa et al. (2024, MNRAS, 527, 4031, arXiv:2303.05743)

• Tanikawa et al. (2024, OJAp, 7, 39, arXiv:2404.01731)



- Gaia mission and its follow-up observations have discovered many inert compact binaries, so-called Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs.
- These Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs cannot be formed in the conventional binary evolution model (but see Kotko et al. 2024; Iorio et al. 2024; El-Badry et al. 2024; Poojan's talk).
- Gaia BHs can be formed efficiently in open clusters (Tanikawa et al. 2024, MNRAS, 527, 4031; see also Rastello et al. 2023; Di Carlo et al. 2024; Marin Pina et al. 2024).
- But, Gaia NSs cannot (Tanikawa et al. 2024, OJAp, 7, 39).
- Gaia NS formation remains an open question.

- Gaia mission and its follow-up observations have discovered many inert compact binaries, so-called Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs.
- These Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs cannot be formed in the conventional binary evolution model (but see Kotko et al. 2024; Iorio et al. 2024; El-Badry et al. 2024; Poojan's talk).
- Gaia BHs can be formed efficiently in open clusters (Tanikawa et al. 2024, MNRAS, 527, 4031; see also Rastello et al. 2023; Di Carlo et al. 2024; Marin Pina et al. 2024).
- But, Gaia NSs cannot (Tanikawa et al. 2024, OJAp, 7, 39).
- Gaia NS formation remains an open question.





- Gaia mission and its follow-up observations have discovered many inert compact binaries, so-called Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs.
- These Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs cannot be formed in the conventional binary evolution model (but see Kotko et al. 2024; Iorio et al. 2024; El-Badry et al. 2024; Poojan's talk).
- Gaia BHs can be formed efficiently in open clusters (Tanikawa et al. 2024, MNRAS, 527, 4031; see also Rastello et al. 2023; Di Carlo et al. 2024; Marin Pina et al. 2024).
- But, Gaia NSs cannot (Tanikawa et al. 2024, OJAp, 7, 39).
- Gaia NS formation remains an open question.





- Gaia mission and its follow-up observations have discovered many inert compact binaries, so-called Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs.
- These Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs cannot be formed in the conventional binary evolution model (but see Kotko et al. 2024; Iorio et al. 2024; El-Badry et al. 2024; Poojan's talk).
- Gaia BHs can be formed efficiently in open clusters (Tanikawa et al. 2024, MNRAS, 527, 4031; see also Rastello et al. 2023; Di Carlo et al. 2024; Marin Pina et al. 2024).
- But, Gaia NSs cannot (Tanikawa et al. 2024, OJAp, 7, 39).
- Gaia NS formation remains an open question.





- Gaia mission and its follow-up observations have discovered many inert compact binaries, so-called Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs.
- These Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs cannot be formed in the conventional binary evolution model (but see Kotko et al. 2024; Iorio et al. 2024; El-Badry et al. 2024; Poojan's talk).
- Gaia BHs can be formed efficiently in open clusters (Tanikawa et al. 2024, MNRAS, 527, 4031; see also Rastello et al. 2023; Di Carlo et al. 2024; Marin Pina et al. 2024).
- But, Gaia NSs cannot (Tanikawa et al. 2024, OJAp, 7, 39).
- Gaia NS formation remains an open question.







## Gaia



## Visible star

## Gaia



## Visible star

## • BH/NS

\*\*==\*

## Gaia



## Visible star

## ) BH/NS





Gaia BH3 (Gaia collaboration 2024); Gaia NS1 (El-Badry et al. (2024a) ...



## Gaia



## Visible star

## • BH/NS

\*\*==\*



Gaia BH3 (Gaia collaboration 2024); Gaia NS1 (El-Badry et al. (2024a) ...



## Gaia



## Visible star

## • BH/NS



Gaia BH3 (Gaia collaboration 2024); Gaia NS1 (El-Badry et al. (2024a) ...





# Inert/dormant/non-interaction compact binary



# Inert/dormant/non-interaction compact binary







# Inert/dormant/non-interaction compact binary



I use the term "inert" in this talk.

"Inert"

 $10^2 \lesssim P/\text{day} \lesssim 10^4$ 



# High $\alpha_{ce}$ is needed for isolated binary channel

El-Badry et al. (2023a)

 $M_{1, ZAMS} [M_{\odot}] = 70.6^{+1.3}_{-1.7}$ 





# High $\alpha_{ce}$ is needed for isolated binary channel

El-Badry et al. (2023a)

 $M_{1, ZAMS}[M_{\odot}] = 70.6^{+1.3}_{-1.7}$ 





# High $\alpha_{ce}$ is needed for isolated binary channel

El-Badry et al. (2023a)

 $M_{1, ZAMS}[M_{\odot}] = 70.6^{+1.3}_{-1.7}$ 



 $|\text{If } \alpha_{\text{ce}} \sim 1, \ldots|$ 



El-Badry et al. (2023a)



El-Badry et al. (2023a)



• Dynamical capture in open clusters

• Dynamical capture in open clusters

Typical formation mode of Gaia BH/NS



• Dynamical capture in open clusters

Typical formation mode of Gaia BH/NS





clusters



- Cluster parameters
  - Cluster mass:  $200 2000 M_{\odot}$
  - Metallicity: Z = 0.0002 0.02
  - Mass density:  $2 200 M_{\odot}/\text{pc}^3$
  - Binary fraction: 0, 20, 50 %

- Cluster parameters •
  - Cluster mass:  $200 2000 M_{\odot}$
  - Metallicity: Z = 0.0002 0.02
- Mass density: 2 200 M<sub>o</sub>/pc<sup>3</sup>
  Binary fraction: 0, 20, 50 %

 $1.4 \times 10^{8} M_{\odot}$ in total

- Cluster parameters •
  - Cluster mass:  $200 2000 M_{\odot}$
  - Metallicity: Z = 0.0002 0.02
  - Mass density:  $2 200 M_{\odot}/\text{pc}^3$
  - Binary fraction: 0, 20, 50 %

 $1.4 \times 10^8 M_{\odot}$ in total





in total

- Cluster parameters •
  - Cluster mass:  $200 2000 M_{\odot}$
  - Metallicity: Z = 0.0002 0.02
  - Mass density:  $2 200 M_{\odot}/\text{pc}^3$
  - Binary fraction: 0, 20, 50 %
- Primordial binary parameters
  - Primary star: Kroupa's IMF
  - $f(m_2/m_1) \propto (m_2/m_1)^{-0.1} (0.1 \le m_2/m_1 \le 1)$





- Cluster parameters •
  - Cluster mass:  $200 2000 M_{\odot}$
  - Metallicity: Z = 0.0002 0.02
  - Mass density:  $2 200 M_{\odot}/\text{pc}^3$
  - Binary fraction: 0, 20, 50 %
- Primordial binary parameters
  - Primary star: Kroupa's IMF
  - $f(m_2/m_1) \propto (m_2/m_1)^{-0.1} (0.1) \le m_2/m_1 \le 1)$  $1M_{\odot}$  NS  $1M_{\odot}$  $10M_{\odot}$





in total





- Cluster parameters •
  - Cluster mass:  $200 2000 M_{\odot}$
  - Metallicity: Z = 0.0002 0.02
  - Mass density:  $2 200 M_{\odot}/\text{pc}^3$
  - Binary fraction: 0, 20, 50 %
- Primordial binary parameters
  - Primary star: Kroupa's IMF
  - $f(m_2/m_1) \propto (m_2/m_1)^{-0.1} (0.1) \le m_2/m_1 \le 1)$  $10 M_{\odot}$  $1M_{\odot}$ NS





in total

Gaia BHs could not be formed without dynamical interactions.







## Wang et al. (2020)





## Wang et al. (2020)





# Criteria of Gaia BH/NS





# Criteria of Gaia BH/NS




#### Criteria of Gaia BH/NS

#### MS, PMS, He star





#### Criteria of Gaia BH/NS









Formation efficiency of Gaia BH









density, binary fraction, and metallicity

~  $10^{-6} M_{\odot}^{-1}$  for clusters with reasonable mass,



#### ~ $10^{-6}M_{\odot}^{-1}$ for clusters with reasonable mass, density, binary fraction, and metallicity

 $N_{\text{GaiaBH,MW}} \sim 6 \times 10^3 \left( \frac{\eta}{10^{-6}M} \right)$ 

$$\frac{1}{M_{\odot}^{-1}} \left( \frac{M_{\rm MW}}{6.1 \times 10^{10} M_{\odot}} \right) \left( \frac{f_{\rm cluster}}{0.1} \right)$$



#### ~ $10^{-6}M_{\odot}^{-1}$ for clusters with reasonable mass, density, binary fraction, and metallicity

 $N_{\text{GaiaBH,MW}} \sim 6 \times 10^3 \left( \frac{\eta}{10^{-6}M} \right)$ 

#### Sufficiently large to explain the presence of Gaia BHs

$$\frac{1}{M_{\odot}^{-1}} \left( \frac{M_{\rm MW}}{6.1 \times 10^{10} M_{\odot}} \right) \left( \frac{f_{\rm cluster}}{0.1} \right)$$





Formation efficiency of Gaia NS









- Observation
- # of Gaia BHs (3) < # of Gaia NSs (21)

- Observation
- # of Gaia BHs (3) < # of Gaia NSs (21)
- Intrinsic population
- # of Gaia BHs ? # of Gaia NSs

- Observation
- # of Gaia BHs (3) < # of Gaia NSs (21)
- Intrinsic population
- # of Gaia BHs ? # of Gaia NSs





- Observation
- # of Gaia BHs (3) < # of Gaia NSs (21)
- Intrinsic population
- # of Gaia BHs ? # of Gaia NSs





- Observation
- # of Gaia BHs (3) < # of Gaia NSs (21)
- Intrinsic population
- # of Gaia BHs < # of Gaia NSs





- Observation
- # of Gaia BHs (3) < # of Gaia NSs (21)
- Intrinsic population
- # of Gaia BHs < # of Gaia NSs



• Formation efficiencies in open clusters •  $\eta$  of Gaia BHs  $\gg \eta$  of Gaia NSs





- Observation
- # of Gaia BHs (3) < # of Gaia NSs (21)
- Intrinsic population
- # of Gaia BHs < # of Gaia NSs

P = 1000 day More easily discovered by astrometry a = 4.4 au BH: 10*M*<sub>☉</sub>

• Formation efficiencies in open clusters •  $\eta$  of Gaia BHs  $\gg \eta$  of Gaia NSs

Noticeable contradiction  $\implies$  Open clusters cannot form both.











• Gaia BH can be formed in dense star clusters. But, Gaia NSs...



- Gaia BH can be formed in dense star clusters. But, Gaia NSs...
- Isolated binary evolution X
  - Need higher  $\alpha_{ce}$  ( ~ 10) than expected



- Gaia BH can be formed in dense star clusters. But, Gaia NSs...
- Isolated binary evolution **X** 
  - Need higher  $\alpha_{ce}$  ( ~ 10) than expected
- Open cluster 🗙
  - Underproduction of Gaia NSs compared to Gaia BHs (This talk)



- Gaia BH can be formed in dense star clusters. But, Gaia NSs...
- Isolated binary evolution X
  - Need higher  $\alpha_{ce}$  ( ~ 10) than expected
- Open cluster 🗙
  - Underproduction of Gaia NSs compared to Gaia BHs (This talk)
- Triple star system X
  - Need higher  $\alpha_{ce}$  ( ~ 10) than expected, again





- Gaia BH can be formed in dense star clusters. But, Gaia NSs...
- Isolated binary evolution X
  - Need higher  $\alpha_{ce}$  ( ~ 10) than expected
- Open cluster 🗙
  - Underproduction of Gaia NSs compared to Gaia BHs (This talk)
- Triple star system X
  - Need higher  $\alpha_{ce}$  (~ 10) than expected, again





- Gaia BH can be formed in dense star clusters. But, Gaia NSs...
- Isolated binary evolution X
  - Need higher  $\alpha_{ce}$  ( ~ 10) than expected
- Open cluster 🗙
  - Underproduction of Gaia NSs compared to Gaia BHs (This talk)
- Triple star system X
  - Need higher  $\alpha_{ce}$  (~ 10) than expected, again
- Gaia NS formation remains an open question.



## Conclusions of this talk

- Gaia mission and its follow-up observations have discovered many inert compact binaries, so-called Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs.
- These Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs cannot be formed in the conventional binary evolution model (but see Kotko et al. 2024; Iorio et al. 2024; El-Badry et al. 2024; Poojan's talk).
- Gaia BHs can be formed efficiently in open clusters (Tanikawa et al. 2024, MNRAS, 527, 4031; see also Rastello et al. 2023; Di Carlo et al. 2024; Marin Pina et al. 2024).
- But, Gaia NSs cannot (Tanikawa et al. 2024, OJAp, 7, 39).
- Gaia NS formation remains an open question.







## Conclusions of this talk

- Gaia mission and its follow-up observations have discovered many inert compact binaries, so-called Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs.
- These Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs cannot be formed in the conventional binary evolution model (but see Kotko et al. 2024; Iorio et al. 2024; El-Badry et al. 2024; Poojan's talk).
- Gaia BHs can be formed efficiently in open clusters (Tanikawa et al. 2024, MNRAS, 527, 4031; see also Rastello et al. 2023; Di Carlo et al. 2024; Marin Pina et al. 2024).
- But, Gaia NSs cannot (Tanikawa et al. 2024, OJAp, 7, 39).
- Gaia NS formation remains an open question.





## Conclusions of this talk

- Gaia mission and its follow-up observations have discovered many inert compact binaries, so-called Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs.
- These Gaia BHs and Gaia NSs cannot be formed in the conventional binary evolution model (but see Kotko et al. 2024; Iorio et al. 2024; El-Badry et al. 2024; Poojan's talk).
- Gaia BHs can be formed efficiently in open clusters (Tanikawa et al. 2024, MNRAS, 527, 4031; see also Rastello et al. 2023; Di Carlo et al. 2024; Marin Pina et al. 2024).
- But, Gaia NSs cannot (Tanikawa et al. 2024, OJAp, 7, 39).
- Gaia NS formation remains an open question.


















# モロッコ Fu 姫路 Eihei

### Fukui, Japan

ΞQ

If the past few months are any indication, tourism in Japan could surpass pre-pandemic levels in 2024. To escape the urban sprawl and see <u>one of the most spiritual</u> parts of the country, go to Fukui. Naomi Mano, president and chief executive of the Tokyo-based travel company <u>Luxurique</u>, says the city is a destination for temples, onsens (hot spring baths), art and food (specifically Echizen crab). With a new bullet train line set to open <u>in March</u>, travelers can get to Fukui from Tokyo in about three hours.



### The Washington Post

Democracy Dies in Darkness

Subscribe

### Sign in

### Where to travel in 2024, without crowds" by the Washington Post

-ビスに関するフィードバックを送信 1000 km L

## Natal kick?



- $m_1 = 10 M_{\odot}, m_2 = 1 M_{\odot}$
- $a_i = 0.025$  au,  $e_i = 0 \Longrightarrow a_i = 2.5$  au
- Large kick velocity is needed ( $v_k \gtrsim 250$  km/s).
- Center-of-mass velocity exceeds  $\sim 250$  km/s.
  - Inconsistent with the fact that Gaia BHs are the Galactic disk components.
- Eccentricity is quite high (  $\gtrsim 0.99$ ).
  - Inconsistent with moderate eccentricities of Gaia BHs (  $\sim 0.5$ ).



# Natal kick?



- $m_1 = 10 M_{\odot}, m_2 = 1 M_{\odot}$
- $a_i = 0.025$  au,  $e_i = 0 \Longrightarrow a_i = 2.5$  au
- Large kick velocity is needed ( $v_k \gtrsim 250$  km/s).
- Center-of-mass velocity exceeds  $\sim 250$  km/s.
  - Inconsistent with the fact that Gaia BHs are the Galactic disk components.
- Eccentricity is quite high (  $\gtrsim 0.99$ ).
  - Inconsistent with moderate eccentricities of Gaia BHs (  $\sim 0.5$ ).



# Natal kick?



- $m_1 = 10M_{\odot}, m_2 = 1M_{\odot}$
- $a_i = 0.025$  au,  $e_i = 0 \Longrightarrow a_i = 2.5$  au
- Large kick velocity is needed ( $v_k \gtrsim 250$  km/s).
- Center-of-mass velocity exceeds  $\sim 250$  km/s.
  - Inconsistent with the fact that Gaia BHs are the Galactic disk components.
- Eccentricity is quite high (  $\gtrsim 0.99$ ).
  - Inconsistent with moderate eccentricities of Gaia BHs (  $\sim 0.5$ ).





- $m_1 = 10M_{\odot}, m_2 = 1M_{\odot}$
- $a_i = 0.025$  au,  $e_i = 0 \Longrightarrow a_i = 2.5$  au
- Large kick velocity is needed ( $v_k \gtrsim 250$  km/s).
- Center-of-mass velocity exceeds  $\sim 250$  km/s.
  - Inconsistent with the fact that Gaia BHs are the Galactic disk components.
- Eccentricity is quite high (  $\gtrsim 0.99$ ).
  - Inconsistent with moderate eccentricities of Gaia BHs (  $\sim 0.5$ ).



### The number of Gaia BHs captured by PBHs

•  $N_{\rm GBH} = N_{\rm PBH} n_{\rm star} \sigma v T$ 

$$N_{\rm PBH} \sim 2 \times 10^{3} \left( \frac{M_{\rm DM}}{2 \times 10^{11} M_{\odot}} \right) \left( \frac{M_{\rm PBH}}{10 M_{\odot}} \right)^{-1} \left( \frac{f_{\rm PBH}}{10^{-3}} \right) \left( \frac{f_{\rm disk}}{10^{-3}} \right) \left( \frac{f_{\rm corotate}}{0.1} \right)$$

$$N_{\rm star} \sim 2 \ \mathrm{pc}^{-3} \left( \frac{M_{\rm disk}}{6 \times 10^{10} M_{\odot}} \right) \left( \frac{M_{\rm star}}{1 M_{\odot}} \right)^{-1} \left( \frac{R_{\rm disk}}{10 \mathrm{kpc}} \right)^{-2} \left( \frac{h_{\rm disk}}{100 \mathrm{pc}} \right)^{-1}$$

$$\sigma = \pi a^{2} \left( 1 + \frac{G(M_{\rm PBH} + M_{\rm star})}{a v^{2}} \right) \sim 5.8 \times 10^{-10} \ \mathrm{pc}^{2} \left( \frac{M_{\rm PBH} + M_{\rm star}}{11 M_{\odot}} \right) \left( \frac{a}{1 \mathrm{au}} \right)^{-1} \left( \frac{v}{50 \mathrm{km/s}} \right)^{-1}$$

$$N_{\rm GBH} \sim 1 \left( \frac{N_{\rm PBH}}{2 \times 10^{3}} \right) \left( \frac{n_{\rm star}}{2 \mathrm{pc}^{-3}} \right) \left( \frac{\sigma}{5.8 \times 10^{-10} \mathrm{pc}^{2}} \right) \left( \frac{v}{50 \mathrm{km/s}} \right) \left( \frac{T}{10 \mathrm{Gyr}} \right)$$



- We reduce NS natal kicks to zero.
- The formation efficiency of Gaia NSs is still comparable to that of Gaia BHs.
- Moreover, Gaia NSs are formed from primordial binaries, not through dynamical capture.
- No need to consider Gaia NS formation in open clusters in this case.

# No natal kick model



# Frequency of 3rd stars

















